# Smarter Agriculture: A pathway to evidence-based policy and management recommendations for agriculture

Sylvie M. Brouder Agronomy Dept. Purdue Univ. 12/4/2013

# Dr. Plaut: What is the research case for Big Data?

- Turn information into insights
- Connects and empowers people
- Evidence based decision making
- Can develop integrated solutions to complex problems
- Federal mandate from the OSTP (Office of Science, Technology and Policy) that all federal agencies that award grants must make data available
- Cost Efficiencies

### "Smarter Agriculture" ~ What do we need (to have, to be doing, etc.) to use data better in agricultural policy and management (research too)?



# Why are data not reused?

- Not useful? Question has changed... Hmmm: Yes & No
- Not accessible? Poor data hygiene...
  - Diekmann interviews (J. Ag. & Food Info., 2012):
  - "The researcher wanted to reanalyze data from another figure and I couldn't find it. And I couldn't; I lost it. It was done on an old computer system and the technician who did [it, had] moved on and I wasn't able to find it."
  - "We have had a lot of problems in the past of losing data, or just misplacing it. And then we have to backtrack it and that's taken literally days or weeks to find where this data was stored. So it has been a real problem for us."

# Why are data not reused?

- Too much work? Lack of data workflow tools...
  - Diekmann interviews (J. Ag. & Food Info., 2012):
  - "[Another group of scientists and I] were talking about, can we get our data and pull it together? They wanted that data, [but] **it's the annotation that's really the hard part** [for] them [to be] able to make sense of it. I would be happy to give [out the data], but [then] I have to explain whatever I did."
- Too expensive? > 80% of scientists surveyed in 2010 indicated that they did not have resources to make their data open access (Science. Feb. 2011)

### **Question of Money, Motivation, and Mechanics...**

## Taking a peek at data caretaking in AGRY... K Team Fellow (PhD student supported by Mosaic and PCS)

| - to Search K Plots data      |     |                         |                    |             |  |  |  |  |
|-------------------------------|-----|-------------------------|--------------------|-------------|--|--|--|--|
|                               | ~ · | K_HOB_Gala V            | • • • Jean Search  | rois_uutu   |  |  |  |  |
| Organize   Include in library | S   | hare with   New folder  |                    | •           |  |  |  |  |
| 🚖 Favorites                   |     | Name                    | Date modified      | Туре        |  |  |  |  |
| 📃 Desktop                     |     | <u>)</u> 2009           | 10/31/2013 2:27 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 🐌 Downloads                   |     | <b>)</b> 2010           | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 💱 Dropbox                     |     | <b>]</b> 2011           | 10/31/2013 2:23 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 🐉 Recent Places               |     | 🔔 A&L LAB               | 10/31/2013 2:23 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
|                               |     | 👃 K Balance             | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 闫 Libraries                   | ≡   | 👃 K removal             | 12/10/2013 8:53 A  | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| Documents                     |     | 👃 Lower depths          | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 🕹 Music                       |     | 👃 Non_linear regression | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| le Pictures                   |     | 👃 RonaldN               | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| Juleos                        |     | 👃 routine soil test     | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
|                               |     | 👃 SAS_files             | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 🤣 Homegroup                   |     | STB_K_Extraction        | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
|                               |     | 👃 STK vs Time           | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| k Computer                    |     | 🚴 Thesis_chapters       | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |
| 🧶 TI104956W0B (C:)            |     | 🔔 трв                   | 10/31/2013 2:25 PM | File folder |  |  |  |  |

### Today, I can tell you what this spreadsheet means but you can't understand all of it on your own...

| 6    |          |         |               |        |             |                        |          |         | X        |                          |               |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
|------|----------|---------|---------------|--------|-------------|------------------------|----------|---------|----------|--------------------------|---------------|----------|------------------|------------------|---------|--------------------|----------------------|----------|----------|----------|--------------|-----------------------|---------|
|      | F)       | 1       | 2             | 3      |             |                        |          |         | AllFan   | IIS_STK_20               | 011_F -       | wiicroso | nt excerno       | n-com            | nercial | use                |                      |          | _        | -        |              |                       |         |
| -    | <i>y</i> | Hom     | e 1           | insert | Page Lay    | out Form               | ilas (   | Data    | Review   | View                     | Add-In        | s Acr    | obat             |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              | <ul> <li>—</li> </ul> | a x     |
| Pa   | aste     |         | Arial<br>18 2 |        | - 10 -      |                        |          |         |          | W<br>Wrap Tex<br>Merge & | t<br>Center + | Gener    | B<br>al<br>% , 5 | .0 .00<br>00 →.0 | Condit  | tional For         | mat as Cell          | tinse    | nt Delet | e Forma  | Σ -<br>t Q - | Sort &                | Find &  |
| Clip | •<br>boa | . G     |               | F      | Font        | C                      |          | A       | lianment |                          | 6             |          | Number           | 6                | Format  | tting * Ta<br>Styl | ble * Styles *<br>es |          | Cells    | · ·      | -            | Filter * S<br>Editing | elect * |
|      |          |         |               |        |             |                        |          |         |          |                          |               |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
|      | 4        |         | BC            | D      | F           | F                      | G        | Н       |          | . I                      | K             | -        |                  | N O              | P       | 0                  | R                    | S        | Т        | Ш        | V            | W                     |         |
| 1    | TPAC     | 2011    |               | 0      | -           |                        |          |         |          |                          | IX.           | -        | note:            | 111-132          | were sa | ampled du          | ing the fall         |          | Ň        | 0        |              |                       |         |
| 2    | K ana    | alysis  |               |        |             |                        |          |         |          |                          |               |          |                  | 141-352          | were sa | ampled in t        | he spring            |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
| 3    | Corn     | @ fall/ | spring        |        |             |                        |          |         | K /-     | >                        |               |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          | K (-     |              | L                     |         |
| 4    | Plot     |         | t ann         | denth  | soil wt (a) | Solution (ml)          | Dilution | readout | n (p     | pm)                      | soil          |          | Plot             | trt ann          | deptu   |                    | Summon (ml)          | Dilution | readout  | n (p     | orrected     | soil                  |         |
| 6    | 1 101    | 152 k   | n app         | 1      | 2.01        | 20                     | 1        | 7.4     | 7.3      | 7.3                      | 73            |          | For 111-15       | αταρρ<br>2       | ueptii  | 3011 Wt (g)        | Solution (mi)        | Dilution | reauout  | Solution | conected     | 3011                  |         |
| 7    |          | 152 k   | 1 a           | 2      | 2.01        | 20                     | 1        | 7.2     | 7.1      | 7.1                      | 71            |          | Turmail          | -                |         | 2.03               | 20                   | 1        | 4.9      | 4.8      | 4.8          | 48                    |         |
| 8    |          | 152 k   | (1 a          | 3      | 2.01        | 20                     | 3        | 3.4     | 3.3      | 3.3                      | 99            |          | Clermont         |                  |         | 2.06               | 20                   | 1        | 9.3      | 9.2      | 9.2          | 89                    |         |
| 9    |          | 152 k   | (1 a          | 4      | 2.01        | 20                     | 3        | 4.5     | 4.4      | 4.4                      | 132           |          | S-2              |                  |         | 2.04               | 20                   | 1        | 8.8      | 8.7      | 8.7          | 85                    |         |
| 10   |          | 152 k   | :1 a          | 5      | 2.07        | 20                     | 3        | 4.7     | 4.6      | 4.6                      | 134           |          | Blank            |                  |         |                    | 20                   | 1        | 0        | -0.05    |              |                       |         |
| 11   |          | 152 k   | (1 a          | 6      | 2.02        | 20                     | 1        | 10.2    | 10.1     | 10.1                     | 100           |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
| 12   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 1      | 2.05        | 20                     | 1        | 7.2     | 7.1      | 7.1                      | 69            |          | For 211-25       | 2                |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
| 13   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 2      | 2.03        | 20                     | 1        | 5.5     | 5.4      | 5.4                      | 53            |          | Turmail          |                  |         | 2.08               | 20                   | 1        | 5.2      | 5.1      | 5.1          | 49                    |         |
| 14   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 3      | 2.08        | 20                     | 3        | 2.6     | 2.5      | 2.5                      | 71            |          | Clermont         |                  |         | 2.01               | 20                   | 3        | 3.4      | 3.3      | 3.3          | 97                    |         |
| 15   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 4      | 2.06        | 20                     | 3        | 3.4     | 3.3      | 3.3                      | 95            |          | S-2              |                  |         | 2                  | 20                   | 1        | 8.7      | 8.6      | 8.5          | 85                    |         |
| 16   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 5      | 2.03        | 20                     | 1        | 7.9     | 7.8      | 7.7                      | 76            |          | Blank            |                  |         |                    | 20                   | 1        | 0.1      | 0.1      | 0.0          |                       |         |
| 17   |          | 252 k   | (1 a          | 6      | 2.06        | 20                     | 1        | 7.6     | 7.5      | 7.5                      | 72            |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
| 18   |          | 351 k   | (1 a          | 1      | 2.02        | 20                     | 3        | 3.2     | 3.1      | 3.1                      | 93            |          | For 311-35       | 2                |         |                    |                      |          |          |          |              |                       |         |
| 19   |          | 351 k   | (1 a          | 2      | 2.01        | 20                     | 1        | 6.9     | 6.8      | 6.8                      | 68            |          | Turmail          |                  |         | 2.08               | 20                   | 1        | 5        | 4.9      | 4.9          | 47                    |         |
| 20   |          | 351 k   | (1 a          | 3      | 2.04        | 20                     | 3        | 3.4     | 3.3      | 3.3                      | 98            |          | Clermont         |                  |         | 2.04               | 20                   | 1        | 9.7      | 9.6      | 9.6          | 94                    |         |
| 21   |          | 351 k   | (1 a          | 4      | 2.07        | 20                     | 3        | 3.7     | 3.6      | 3.6                      | 105           |          | S-2              |                  |         | 2.05               | 20                   | 1        | 8.7      | 8.6      | 8.6          | 84                    |         |
| 22   |          | 351 k   | (1 a          | 5      | 2.04        | 20                     | 3        | 3.6     | 3.5      | 3.5                      | 103           |          | Blank            |                  |         |                    | 20                   | 1        | 0        | -0.05    |              |                       | _       |
| 23   | 4        | 351 k   | 1 9           | 9      | 2 03        | 20                     | 1        | 71      | 70       | 70                       | 69            |          | 10.0             |                  |         |                    | CEDAC C              | 1.00     |          | 4        |              |                       | _       |
|      |          | M       | neet1         |        | AC_Corn     | <pre>// TPAC_Soy</pre> | /bean    | PPAC_   | _Corn    | PPAC_So                  | bybean        | NEP      | AC_Corn          | NEP              | 4C_50y  | bean 🖉             | SEPAC_Corn           | SE       | PAC_S    |          |              |                       |         |
| Rea  | ady      |         |               |        |             |                        |          |         | /        |                          |               |          |                  |                  |         |                    |                      | 6        | ≝∎ ₽     | 80% (    | )            | Û I                   | -(+)    |

What is this???

### Tomorrow, we may both be in the dark...

Precarious Nature of Data Lifecycle: Scientifically proven that my ability to understand and find these data will erode extremely rapidly!



Pressing technological challenges to informatics for all agronomic efforts concern data workflow...

### Data dispersion

- Take advantage of small datasets collected by many researchers (not everything is "BIG")
- Data heterogeneity
  - Varied protocols reflecting local culture & variation in 1° purpose

### Data provenance

 Need to track data through multi-step process of aggregation, modeling, analysis

| MINITAE<br>44 Jpecia<br>Jat<br>1. 98-5<br>1. 98 | P. J. F<br>field,<br>P. J. F<br>field,<br>P. H.<br>S. G. G.<br>S. G. G. G. G.<br>S. G. G. G. G.<br>S. G. G. G. G. G.<br>S. G. G. G. G. G.<br>S. G. | 13 125<br>13 125<br>13 125<br>17<br>34<br>5 2404<br>14<br>149<br>149<br>149<br>149<br>149<br>149<br>149 | 230<br>230<br>230<br>234<br>9992<br>265 |           | pme      |        |
|--|--|---|---|-----------|----------|--------|
| SOM_Q3<br>AllPtsv<br>V_CYBZor<br>CYB_D2_1  | 30 mant  | Ener Cher   | mical Sever                             | ce Labora | tary.    | St 30  |
| ■KawV<br>■SOM Q4 NoOut   | 8 GnB2   |   | 26880 34                                | 2032.80   | 34       | 3.3081 |
| SOM_Q2_NoOut   | 9 GnB2   |   | 23664 34                                | 2039.08   | 34       | 3.3094 |
| SOM_Q2   | 10 GnB2  |   | 23663 34                                | 2051.00   | 34       | 3.3119 |
| ■ V_SOMZones<br>■ V_CYBZones   | 11 GnB2  |   | 23578 34                                | 2117.51   | 34       | 3.3258 |
| SOM 04   | 12 GnB2  |   | 26879 34                                | 2168.95   | 34       | 3.3362 |
|  | 13 GnB2  |   | 26884 34                                | 2204.09   | 34       | 3.3432 |
|  | 14 GnB2  |   | 26789 34                                | 2267.46   |          | 3.3555 |
|  | 15 GnB2  |   | 23062 34                                | 2299.45   | 54<br>24 | 3.3616 |
|  | 10 GND2  |   | 20079  34                               | 2335.22   | - 54     | 3.3683 |

How hard/expensive can it be???? (Why is posting data on a website NOT enough...)

- Lack of longevity
  - I depart and my webpage may or may not be in maintained (the original source is responsible for preservation and curation).
  - Web pages are updated and links are not
  - Lack of forward formatting (who remembers Lotus 1,2,3?)
  - Data provenance disappears (where DID this number come from)
- Lack of rigor, standardization and process
  - You annotate your data in a way YOU think describes it adequately but no one else reviews it... not standardized because you are not following a protocol (we love to make up our own terms ~ part of showing novelty of endeavor)
  - Not "tagged" for searching
  - Does not have a Digital Object Identifier (DOI: unique & persistent identifier)

# Purdue University Research Repository: What libraries are to books, PURR is to data (plus so much more!)



Home

### Start Your Research Project



#### Create a Data Management Plan

Learn about the detailed requirements for your data management plan (DMP). Funding agency requirements are very specific and our DMP resources can help you to clear up any confusion. Get Started >



### Upload Research Data to Your Project

Create a project to upload and share your data with collaborators using our step-by-step form to guide you through the process. Invite collaborators from other institutions to join your project. Create a Project >



#### **Publish your Dataset**

Package, describe, and publish your dataset with a Datacite DOI. Publishing will ensure your dataset is citable, reusable, and archived for the long-term. See Published Datasets >



#### ou have a question?



# Very first PURR data publication: Volenec Alfalfa data looks like Navarrete K data (mostly)...

| Past  | te 🦪           | BI    | <u>u</u> - | -        | A -      | <b>e e</b> : |          | <b>E</b> M | erge & Ce | nter 👻   | \$ - %      | • <u>*.0</u> | .00<br>>.0 | Conditional<br>Formatting * | Format as<br>Table * | Cell<br>Styles + | Insert<br>•  | Delete For     | rmat<br>•         |  |
|-------|----------------|-------|------------|----------|----------|--------------|----------|------------|-----------|----------|-------------|--------------|------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|------------------|--------------|----------------|-------------------|--|
| Clipb | oa 🖻           |       | Font       |          | Gi (     |              | Alig     | Inment     |           | - Di     | Numb        | er           | 6          |                             | Styles               |                  |              | Cells          |                   |  |
|       | Q1098 • fr 140 |       |            |          |          |              |          |            |           |          |             |              |            |                             |                      |                  |              |                |                   |  |
|       | A              | В     | С          | D        | E        | F            | G        | Н          |           | J        | K           | L            | N          | 1 N                         | 0                    | P                | Q            | R              | S                 |  |
| 1     |                |       |            |          |          |              |          |            |           |          |             |              |            | P (mg/kg)                   |                      |                  | K (m         |                | naka)             |  |
| 2     | Year           | Month | Пер        | Plot No. | Treatmer | n∣K, kg/ha   | P, kg/ha | ield (kg/h | stems/m2  | plants/n | n2iss/shoot | 0-2          | 2-         | 4 4-6                       | 6-8                  | 0-8              | 0-2          | 2-4            | 4-6               |  |
| 1113  | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 411      | 19       | 400          | 50       |            |           |          |             | 24.5         | 7.         | 0 9.3                       | 5.3                  |                  | ///250/3/    | 112:19         | ////%2%           |  |
| 114   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 412      | 3        | 0            | 50       |            |           |          |             | 29.1         | 8.         | 0 7.0                       | 5.1                  |                  | <b>190 0</b> | 34.8           | 803               |  |
| 115   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 413      | 15       | 300          | 50       |            |           |          |             | 30.2         | 7.         | 8 7.2                       | 5.9                  |                  | 228/2        | 92 Q           | /// <u>5</u> 87.1 |  |
| 1116  | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 414      | 2        | 0            | 25       |            |           |          |             | 18.3         | 7.         | 3 7.2                       | 7.2                  |                  | 59.9         | 84.8           | 881               |  |
| 117   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 415      | 6        | 100          | 25       |            |           |          |             | 19.1         | 7.         | 0 7.1                       | 6.3                  |                  | 110.0        | 52.8           | 84.1              |  |
| 1118  | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 416      | 9        | 200          | 0        |            |           |          |             | 9.2          | 6.         | 5 7.7                       | 6.4                  |                  | 150.0        | 108.0          | ///BAX            |  |
| 1119  | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 417      | 5        | 100          | 0        |            |           |          |             | 10.0         | 7.         | 0 7.3                       | 7.7                  |                  | 1285         | 92.9           | /// ESU 1         |  |
| 120   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 418      | 10       | 200          | 25       |            |           |          |             | 19.5         | 7.         | 8 8.3                       | 7.7                  |                  | 1569 19      | 84.0           | ////1028          |  |
| 121   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 419      | 4        | 0            | 75       |            |           |          |             | 35.1         | 10         | .1 10.1                     | 27.3                 |                  | 30.9         | 84.0           | ///88/            |  |
| 122   | 2000           | 4     | 4          | 420      | 11       | 200          | 50       |            |           |          |             | 26.3         | 7.         | 6 7.7                       | 7.6                  |                  | 158.8        | 80.0           | ////28/           |  |
| 123   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 101      | 8        | 100          | 75       | 5566.0457  | 401.76453 |          |             | 57.7         | 18         | .7 9.5                      | 12.1                 |                  | 90.2         | 11/32/5///     | ///¥£/X           |  |
| 124   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 102      | 19       | 400          | 50       | 5908.9126  | 368.11068 |          |             | 36.8         | 9.         | 8 10.5                      | 11.2                 |                  | 239.8        | 128.8          | 84                |  |
| 125   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 103      | 3        | 0            | 50       | 5933.606   | 436.74415 |          |             | 17.7         | 8.         | 6 7.2                       | 9.3                  |                  | 70.1         | 88.0           | //9E.X            |  |
| 126   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 104      | 13       | 300          | 0        | 4455.2046  | 478.95126 |          |             | 12.0         | 7.         | 0 5.8                       | 7.7                  |                  | 299.9        | 108.0          | 104               |  |
| 127   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 105      | 17       | 400          | 0        | 5280.7465  | 469.14948 |          |             | 8.3          | 5.         | 0 3.9                       | 6.8                  |                  | 329.8        | 120.0          | <u> </u>          |  |
| 128   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 106      | 20       | 400          | 75       | 5990.6994  | 424.63137 |          |             | 72.7         | 8.         | 0 7.6                       | 12.2                 |                  | 170.0        | 324.5          | 967               |  |
| 129   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 107      | 12       | 200          | 75       | 5673.7468  | 430.67761 |          |             | 80.5         | 14         | .3 12.8                     | 13.1                 |                  | 139.9        | 11/353         | 100               |  |
| 130   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 108      | 9        | 200          | 0        | 5698.6962  | 635.16453 |          |             | 23.7         | 15         | .2 14.3                     | 14.9                 |                  | 140.1        | /// <u>#</u> # | ////528           |  |
| 131   | 2000           | 5     | 1          | 109      | 1        | 0            | 0        | 6102.5182  | 436.39289 |          |             | 22.4         | 17         | .9 18.5                     | 19.0                 |                  | 99.8         | 1663.0         | 1934              |  |
| 100   | 2000           | -     | -          | 440      | - C      | 100          | 05       | 0000 0070  | E47 07E77 |          |             | 01.0         | 47         | E 40.4                      | 47.0                 |                  | 110.0        | 1111661661111  | /////             |  |

# You can "google" data published in PURR...



# The workflow is predetermined when publishing ~ you are prompted to be comprehensive in the info you provide ~ PU Lib. Information Specialists review it prior to publication...

### Phosphorus and Potassium Influence on Alfalfa Nutrition

By Jeffrey J Volenec

Data from several studies on the influence of phosphorus and potassium nutrition on alfalfa. It includes numeric data such as yield, plant mass, plant counts, and tissue concentration of various nutrients

Listed in Datasets



About Supporting Docs Versions Reviews Questions Citations

#### Supporting Docs



# Supporting documents accessible with datasets.... Alfalfa P/K study

| <u>Column</u> | Description   |
|---------------|---|
| A             | Calendar year when samples were obtained (1997 to 2004)         |
| В             | Month within calendar year when samples were obtained (1 to 12) |
| С             | Field replicate (1 to 4)  |
| D             | Plot number (101 to 420)  |
| F             | Treatment number (1 to 20)                                      |

Summary:

This is a master file of merged excel files with data from several studies on the influence of phosphorus and potassium nutrition on alfalfa. It includes numeric data such as yield, plant mass, plant counts, and tissue concentration of various nutrients. Conventional wisdom states that plants that are poorly fertilized and do not have adequate phosphorus and especially low potassium will become winterkill. This study showed that plants did not necessarily die in winter with low potassium stress.

Study dates: 1997 to 2004.

Location/Latitude and Longitude: Throckmorton Purdue-Agricultural Center located 15 km south of West Lafayette, IN (40°N and 87°W)

Background:

In April 1997, a 1.4-ha site was seeded to Pioneer Brand '5454' alfalfa. This site was selected for study because soil tests indicated low concentrations of extractable P (9 to 15 mg kg<sup>-1</sup> Bray P1) and low to

### "Smarter Agriculture" ~ **Evidence** & **Eminence** in recommendation and policy development



## Ag. Extension Model for Knowledge Creation/Translation Pathway



- "Eminence" Model: The Extension Specialist's Purview to...
- Transform data / research into practical knowledge
- Adapt research results to the farm / farmer environment / context



Current "conventional" way of synthesizing applied & basic research pieces into "big picture" results (e.g. fertilizer recommendations, policy) ~ selection bias favors "peers"



Ohio statusan Applied Res. Philosophy: ✓ Data owned by PI ✓ Don't share raw data ✓ Peer review pubs not essential Reliance on "best professional judgment" (qualitative review)

# What's the problem with a strictly or primarily "eminence" –based framework?

- We are just not using all the data we could or should be using & the amount of data that we could use is skyrocketing (The "Moneyball" Extension Allegory)
  - Extension Specialists are human beings and prone to biases and lapses in judgment at a rate similar to the general population
  - We tend to rely on data that we are familiar to a greater extent than data more distant from us.
  - Training in scientific theory and practice may help overcome this.
- "Best professional judgment" ought to be considered in this light to ensure equal parts eminence and evidence (Note: as experts we are not alone in this problem)

If you've seen it, you expect to see it, you are prone to diagnose it... the power of the "change up" pitch!

# What's the problem cont.

- Can't find the original data/publications to reanalyze/augment → unnecessarily have to redo portions of research (\$\$\$\$\$)
- Guidelines and recommendations not specific enough to satisfy most farmers
- Policy instruments unsatisfying / contentious:
  - Assistance programs don't seem to be achieving desired outcome (e.g. CEAP); costly
  - Regulations perceived as burdensome, inappropriately targeted, ineffectual, suppressing of profitability and economic growth



...differently, more comprehensively, more quantitatively...



# Medical Data and the Grassroots Effort to Make it Available for Evidence-based, Clinical Use

## Kay Dickersin, MA, PhD

Smarter Agriculture: A Dialogue on Critical Data for Agriculture

Potomac, Maryland

October 10, 2013

### Dickersin: Reviews essential in health

- Research evidence generally available in short published papers. Researchers try to publish a lot of them
- Literature is is large and growing (eg, 20,000 biomedical journals)
- Literature is not organized
- Reviews of primary research necessary for coping with information overload





Knowledge translation

## **Dickersin: What is a systematic review?**

- A review of existing knowledge that uses explicit, scientific methods:
  - Structured and transparent process
  - Comprehensive search for relevant articles
  - Explicit methods of appraisal and synthesis
- Summarizes methods and results of similar but separate studies
- May or may not combine results quantitatively (meta-analysis)

Explicit framework for rigorous SR Vs. reviews conducted as low cost, ad hoc, un-structured, grad student level, endeavor...



Dickersin: A "cumulative meta-analysis" showed us how important it is that we synthesize what we know in an **ongoing** fashion



Antman et al JAMA 1994

A. Thrombolytic Therapy



### Dickersin: Who is doing systematic reviews?

Not

Agriculture (yet)

- Selected topic areas
  - Clinical interventions
  - Animal studies
  - Assessment of risk
  - Toxicities
  - Methodologists
  - Education
  - Social welfare
  - Crime and justice
  - International development
- Cochrane Collaboration
- Groups interested in policy (professional societies, governments, payers)
  - Dept. Education, EPA, health insurance
- Businesses: Hayes, ECRI (contracting to pharma)

## Closer to home: Use of science in conservation policy...



(read more about how & why by clicking)

systematic review in environmental management

Call. 3ie invites proposals for systematic reviews around seven policy-relevant questions on the

### Collaboration for Environmental Evidence now using this framework to improve use of science in conservation policy

Systematic Review Protocol Environmental impacts of f evidence Neal R Haddaway, David Style Environmental Evidence 2013, Abstract | Full text | PDF | ePI

Systematic Review Protoco Does production of oil paln Sini Savilaakso, Yves Laumoni Environmental Evidence 2013, Abstract | Full text | PDF | ePt

Systematic Review Protoco How effective are created of review protocol Magnus Land, Wilhelm Granéli Environmental Evidence 2013 Abstract | Full text | PDF | ePU



Open Access

regions: a systematic map of the

osystem functions in tropical forests

View the Guidelines for systematic review in environmental management

phosphorus removal? A systematic

in S Tonderski, Jos TA Verhoeven



SR process helps ID types of bias in independent studies and give pragmatic quality ranking...

Types of bias:

- Selection
- Performance
- Attrition
- Measurement

"Publication"

| Field                                 | Comments  |
|---------------------------------------|---|
| Baseline appropriate / representative | Category (Yes, No, Uncertain) & comment on rationale  |
| Management<br>Intervention relevance  | Category (High, Low, Uncertain) & comment<br>on rationale (e.g. if farmer survey, potential<br>confounding factors are distributed across<br>baseline & intervention treatments<br>(improved seed, access to inputs, labor,<br>etc.)) |
| Experiment execution concerns         | Descriptive: problems with design relative to<br>question (bias), methods concerns<br>(publication bias if a review), externalities,<br>data loss, attrition  |
| Data Extraction<br>concerns           | Not all pieces of data appropriately presented; data in the wrong format; no variance measure   |
| Level of record/data review           | Categorical: Peer-reviewed journal (impact factor), other peer-reviewed format, agency report, unpublished data, etc.   |
| Overall subjective quality assessment | Category (High, Medium, Low, Uncertain) with respect only to the a priori question  |

**Extension's Future**: A decade of reflection & two "shoulds" for ensuring we are the/an unbiased source of knowledge for mgmt practice and policy in a data-rich world...

Repositories: Make data (Vs synthesized results) available for additional/future research

- Requires:
  - Infrastructure
  - Change in culture
  - Better data hygiene

Meta-analysis: Make systematic reviews w/ quantitative methods a "tool of the trade" for tomorrow's Extension Specialist

- Requires:
  - Infrastructure
  - New knowledge

Goal: Using disparate data — iff aggregiate skilo strengthen "inference space"



Knowledge translation



Who has data w/ potential for evidenced-based ag. in the clinical setting... e.g. for a fertilizer rec. or for policy on conservation structure installation/cost share, etc.?

### Intensive research (fewer)

- Long-term exp. w/ regionally relevant benchmark trts for "Mitigation" mgmts
- Evolved agro-ecosystems w/ data records
- Intensive C/N/H<sub>2</sub>O measures

New Concept: "Living Recommendations"

### Replic. / Demo. exp (more)

- Fully-replicated, experiments
- Newly est. trts. of imp. mgmt. variants.
- High risk &/or emerging tech.
- Less intensive routine measures + targeted sampling campaigns

### Commercial Sites (many)

- Farmer Practice vs. improved mgts. (EI)
- "Adaptive Mgmt." approach
- Limited # of trts. & measures
- Focus on trts. w/ near-term, measurable impacts

### "Smarter Agriculture" ~ New Curriculum for DIL



Smarter Ag Workshop: Sample stakeholder feedback ~ Farmer participation in **"open access" data & the data** value chain requires...

- Data Modification: Scholarly data not directly useful to farmer – data needs to be subsetted/distilled in the context of important questions.
- Access to more environmental data (weather & climate specified)
- Data "translation" tools for multiple users
- Multiple forms of delivery to span synthesis for quick digestion ("does it work?") to more nuanced analysis for iterative practice improvement ("adaptive mgmt.")
- Protocols & minimum datasets for on-farm research; farmer input must be sought & protocols should not be arbitrarily inflexible
- (Privacy / security policy assumed to be taken care of?)

Blending different ag data streams at different ed. levels requires new skills & DIL curricula ("Library

## Sciences should be solicited to educate all...")

# Future farmer or ag. industry employee (BS level)

- Everyone needs environmental info. mgmt that teaches how data are produced/used ("data in my life")
- Array of educational trajectories are needed from most basic level to specific endpts.
- Future farm managers need data skills in context of business mgmt & systems analyses
- Be able to understand data from outside their degree & be able to ascertain data quality

### Future consultant, CCA, policy maker, Agent, Ext. Specialist (MS, PhD level)

- Understand exp. design, statistics & probability (risk)
- Understand geospatial data
- Curricula should use open-source software & "workforce-available" statistical tools
- Be able to translate science into lay language w/ context
- CCA: Certificate in Ext. Prgm should cover 12 data competenecies
- Capstone data experience
- Ext. Spec. competent in Systematic Reviews; data mgmt plans / repositories part of degree